2025 DIETARY GUIDELINES ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING 1

Convened by the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) U.S. Department of Agriculture (USDA)

February 9–10, 2023

Dietary Guidelines Advisory Committee Members present:

- Dr. Sarah Booth (Chair)
- Dr. Angela Odoms-Young (Vice Chair)
- Dr. Steven Abrams
- Dr. Cheryl Anderson (virtual)
- Dr. Aline Andres
- Dr. Carol Byrd-Bredbenner
- Dr. Andrea Deierlein
- Dr. Heather Eicher-Miller
- Dr. Teresa Fung
- Dr. Christopher Gardner (virtual)

- Dr. Edward Giovannucci
- Dr. Deanna Hoelscher
- Dr. Valarie Blue Bird Jernigan
- Dr. Jennifer Orlet Fisher
- Dr. Christina Palacios
- Dr. Hollie Raynor
- Dr. Fatima Cody Stanford
- Dr. Sameera Talegawkar
- Dr. Christopher Taylor
- Dr. Deirdre Tobias

Also present:*

- Ms. Janet de Jesus, HHS, Designated Federal Officer
- Ms. Sarah Boateng, Principal Deputy Assistant Secretary for Health, HHS (Feb. 9 only)
- Ms. Elizabeth Rahavi, Branch Chief, Nutrition Guidance Branch, USDA
- Dr. Julie Obbagy, Branch Chief, Nutrition Evidence Systematic Review Branch, USDA
- Dr. TusaRebecca Pannucci, Branch Chief, Nutrition and Economic Analysis Branch, USDA
- Dr. Dana DeSilva, ORISE Health Policy Fellow, HHS
- Ms. Carter Blakey, Deputy Director, Office of Disease Prevention and Health Promotion, HHS (Feb. 10 only)
- Ms. Jackie Haven, Deputy Administrator, Center for Nutrition Policy and Promotion, Food and Nutrition Service, USDA
- Admiral Rachel L. Levine, Assistant Secretary for Health, HHS (Feb. 10 only)
- Ms. Stacy Dean, Deputy Under Secretary, Food, Nutrition, and Consumer Services, USDA (Feb. 10 only)
- Lieutenant Commander Dennis Anderson-Villaluz, Nutrition Advisor, HHS

^{*} The individuals listed here facilitated the meeting agenda items and are listed in the order of appearance on the agenda. Additional in-person attendees included HHS and USDA staff members and contractors who are supporting the *Dietary Guidelines for Americans, 2025-2030*.

The Advisory Committee met in the conference center of the Tower Building, which houses the HHS Office of Disease Prevention and Health Promotion, at 1101 Wootton Parkway, Rockville, MD. The meeting was open to the public via live webcast.

The following is a summary of Meeting 1. For additional details, refer to the videos of $\underline{\text{Day 1}}$ and $\underline{\text{Day 2}}$ and the <u>Meeting 1</u> page of DietaryGuidelines.gov.

DAY 1 – February 9, 2023

WELCOME AND OPENING REMARKS

The first meeting of the 2025 Dietary Guidelines Advisory Committee ("Committee") was convened at 9:00 AM on Thursday, February 9, 2023, at the Tower Oaks conference center of the Tower Building in Rockville, MD.

Ms. Janet de Jesus, Designated Federal Officer for the *Dietary Guidelines for Americans, 2025-2030 (Dietary Guidelines)* and a Nutrition Advisor in the HHS Office of Disease Prevention and Health Promotion, introduced herself and welcomed attendees to the meeting. She expressed gratitude, on behalf of HHS and USDA ("the Departments"), to the Committee members for their acceptance of the appointment to the Committee. She also reviewed the day's agenda: review of operations for Committee members; review of the history and evolution of the Dietary Guidelines; presentations on the evidence-based approaches for reviewing the scientific evidence; overview of the proposed scientific questions identified by the Departments to be examined by the Committee, and plans for future Committee work. Ms. de Jesus noted that whereas the first meeting features several presentations by federal staff who will set the stage for the Committee's work, future meetings will focus heavily on Committee member presentations and discussions about the findings of their work.

SWEARING-IN OF THE COMMITTEE

Ms. Sarah Boateng, Principal Deputy Assistant Secretary for Health at HHS, reiterated the Departments' appreciation for the Committee's service and underscored that the *Dietary Guidelines* are an essential building block to helping all Americans thrive.

Ms. Boateng then administered the oath of office to all Committee members.

COMMITTEE CHARTER, OPERATIONS, AND TIMELINE

Ms. Janet de Jesus reviewed the Committee's charter, operations, and projected timeline of activities.

For context, she explained that the *Dietary Guidelines* provide advice on nutrition intake to meet nutrient needs, promote health, and help prevent chronic disease; serve as the cornerstone of all federal nutrition programs and policies, providing food-based recommendations to help prevent diet-related chronic diseases and promote overall health; and include dietary recommendations across the lifespan, including for pregnancy and lactation. The National Nutrition Monitoring and Related Research Act of 1990 mandates that

the *Dietary Guidelines* be published jointly by HHS and USDA at least every five years and reflect the preponderance of current scientific evidence.

The Committee is formed and governed under the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), which sets forth a formal process for establishing, operating, overseeing, and terminating federal advisory committees. Members of the Committee are appointed as "special government employees," selected based on recognized expertise and expert knowledge relevant to the Committee, and as such were required to undergo rigorous background checks and ethics training. The Committee also received guidance on media interactions and was asked not to speak on behalf of the Committee, to direct media requests to the Departments, and to discuss only information that is publicly available.

FACA dictates that a charter must be established before the Committee can meet or take any action. A <u>charter</u> was filed with Congress on December 9, 2022, and describes the Committee's objectives, scope, and general operations. The Committee will: (1) examine the evidence on specific topics and scientific questions identified by the Departments; (2) develop a report that outlines its science-based review and recommendations to the Department, with a scientific justification for the recommendations; and (3) submit that report to the Secretaries of HHS and USDA for consideration as the Departments develop the *Dietary Guidelines*.

Federal staff from the Departments will support the Committee as it undertakes three approaches for reviewing the evidence—systematic reviews, data analyses, and food pattern modeling, all of which are rigorous, objective, protocol-driven, and designed to minimize bias—but the report's ultimate conclusions and recommendations are those of the Committee. The Committee may establish subcommittees to review the evidence and provide advice to the parent Committee. The subcommittees conduct work between the public, full Committee meetings and during those meetings provide updates for deliberation and decisions by the full Committee.

The Committee is time-limited and will terminate either two years after the date the charter was filed or after the submission of its report to the Secretaries, whichever comes first. The Departments request that the Committee submit its report by October 2024. Six public Committee meetings are planned, all to be held at the Tower Building in Rockville, MD, and publicly available via live webcast: three meetings in 2023 (February 9-10, May 10, and September 13) and three meetings in 2024 (January 25, May 30, and September 26). The third (September 13, 2023) meeting will include an opportunity for virtual oral public comments. Written public comments will be accepted throughout the duration of the committee's work. Both electronic and paper submissions following the directions provided at <u>https://www.dietaryguidelines.gov/get-involved</u> will be accepted. Public comments will be reviewed and provided to the committee on a regular basis.

The responsibility for serving as the *Dietary Guidelines* administrative lead rotates between HHS and USDA every five years. HHS is in this role for the development of the upcoming edition and will work with in partnership USDA to support the Committee and develop the *Dietary*

Guidelines for Americans, 2025-2030. Each edition of the *Dietary Guidelines* builds upon the previous edition, with scientific justification for changes informed by the Committee's scientific report that describes the state of current nutrition science, along with input from federal agencies and the public.

DIETARY GUIDELINES ADVISORY COMMITTEE CHAIR AND VICE-CHAIR REMARKS

Dr. Sarah Booth (Chair) presented a set of proposed guiding principles for the Committee to embrace throughout the duration of its work. At an individual level, she encouraged each Committee member to step outside of one's comfort zone, lead with curiosity, and fully engage. At a team level, she encouraged the Committee to show mutual respect, defer judgment, stay on topic, and create a safe space for candor and the free flow of ideas.

Dr. Angela Odoms-Young (Vice Chair) emphasized the broad diversity and intersecting identities of individuals, families, and communities across the United States. She urged the Committee to center equity in its work and highlighted its opportunity to help inform attainable, accessible recommendations that can help achieve health and wellbeing for all.

HISTORY AND EVOLUTION OF THE *DIETARY GUIDELINES* AND APPROACHES FOR EXAMINING THE EVIDENCE

Ms. Elizabeth Rahavi, Branch Chief, Nutrition Guidance Branch in the USDA Center for Nutrition Policy and Promotion, discussed the history and evolution of the *Dietary Guidelines*, current approaches to examine the evidence and corresponding considerations for the Committee, and future evolution of the *Dietary Guidelines* process.

The first edition of the *Dietary Guidelines* was published in 1980, and the first Committee was established in 1985. While the guidance in each subsequent edition has evolved as nutrition science has advanced and each Committee's review builds on the previous review, the elements that comprise a healthy dietary pattern have remained remarkably consistent over time. More recent edits of the *Dietary Guidelines* have shifted from nutrients to dietary patterns (i.e., combinations of foods eaten over time), with more quantitative and increasingly refined information about what to consume in each edition. The type of publication evolved from brochures to a technical document accompanied by consumer guidance in the form of a pyramid and currently, MyPlate. The technical document is intended for health professional and policymaker audiences who can tailor it to the federal nutrition programs and policies within which they work. The focus of guidance has also evolved from early editions that provided advice for people who are healthy to more recent editions that are applicable to individuals who are healthy and those at risk for diet-related chronic diseases and conditions. People living with chronic disease can also benefit from healthy dietary patterns described in the *Dietary Guidelines*, but they are not intended as clinical guidelines for treating chronic diseases.

The approaches used to review the evidence have advanced from a sole reliance on narrative literature reviews to additional approaches including data analysis, food pattern modeling, systematic reviews, and (since 2015) a combination of these three. These approaches to

examine the evidence are complementary and together inform the Committee's advice to the Departments. Recommendations from the National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine (NASEM) have also been incorporated to continuously improve the processes for all three approaches. New advancements to these approaches for 2025 include systematic reviews with meta-analyses, assessment of research availability, and advances in food pattern modeling.

In terms of considerations for the Committee's evidence review, Ms. Rahavi encouraged continuous refinement of dietary patterns based on stage of life, exploration of variability in intakes and in the range of possible healthful diets so that evidence-based guidance can be provided for the diverse cultures and foodways in the United States, application of a health equity lens to each step of the process, and integration and summarization of the evidence reviewed in the final report. The Departments proposed establishing a cross-cutting working group to outline how health equity will be addressed in a consistent manner across the Committee's work.

Looking ahead, USDA has initiated work with a contractor to gain insights from federal and nonfederal experts on the topic of systems science in the *Dietary Guidelines* process. A report is expected by the end of 2023 to inform future work in this space. HHS and USDA continue to consider NASEM report recommendations for the process to develop the *Dietary Guidelines*, and are also monitoring topics (e.g., precision nutrition, relationships between diet and the microbiome) and research availability for future editions. The Committee may also make research recommendations and suggest topics for future consideration in its report.

NUTRITION EVIDENCE SYSTEMATIC REVIEW (NESR)

Dr. Julie Obaggy, Branch Chief, Nutrition Evidence Systematic Review in the USDA Center for Nutrition Policy and Promotion, expanded on the NESR team and its methodology, processes for evaluating whether there is enough research available to conduct a new or update an existing review, criteria for using existing non-NESR reviews to answer a new systematic review question, and transparency practices. She also briefly discussed NESR's methodology for continuous evidence monitoring and for updating systematic reviews.

NESR staff members are systematic review scientists who collaborate with the Committee to handle all aspects of planning, facilitating, conducting, and documenting the work necessary to complete the Committee's systematic reviews. The NESR methodology for conducting systematic reviews includes developing a protocol, searching for and screening articles, extracting data and assessing risk of bias, synthesizing the evidence, answering the research question and grading the evidence (with a grade of strong, moderate, limited, or not assignable), and recommending future research.

New efforts for the 2025 Committee's process are conducting meta-analyses and evaluating research availability. NESR plans to conduct a limited number of systematic reviews with meta-analyses with the 2025 Committee and has established methods and procedures for when and how to conduct meta-analyses. Evaluating research availability can help the Committee

prioritize their systematic review questions by determining whether sufficient evidence exists to 1) conduct a systematic review on a new question or 2) update an existing systematic review. Evaluating research availability also helps estimate resource needs and timelines.

Dr. Obaggy closed by emphasizing NESR's commitment to transparency and pointed out that NESR's methodology and the Committee's work will be publicly accessible at NESR.usda.gov. A Committee discussion followed and covered topics such as how to handle critical papers that are published after the cut-off date for inclusion in a systematic review, inclusion and exclusion criteria, evidence synthesis, integrating non-NESR systematic reviews, evidence grading criteria, and application of a health equity lens to the systematic review process.

FOOD PATTERN MODELING

Dr. TusaRebecca Pannucci, Branch Chief, Nutrition and Economic Analysis in the USDA Center for Nutrition Policy and Promotion, provided an overview of USDA's dietary patterns, food pattern modeling (FPM) methodology, and the proposed FPM questions and analyses.

USDA's three dietary patterns—healthy, healthy Mediterranean, and healthy vegetarian—are designed to provide a framework to help people carry out *Dietary Guidelines* recommendations in a way that meets personal, cultural, and budgetary considerations. FPM informs USDA's development of relevant dietary patterns for the American population. It is a way to evaluate how specific changes in amounts or types of foods and beverages in a dietary pattern can impact energy and nutrient needs.

HHS and USDA convened a Food Pattern Modeling Interest Group in 2021 to evaluate 1) the highest priority FPM activities for the upcoming *Dietary Guidelines* process and 2) opportunities to improve FPM methods. Four FPM analyses topics have been proposed for the 2025 Committee to address, based on the prioritizing criteria of relevance, importance, potential impact to federal programs, and avoiding duplication with other federal efforts. Federal staff will collaborate with the Committee to undertake the FPM process, produce a report summarizing the methods and results, synthesize the evidence, answer the scientific question, and recommend future research.

A Committee discussion followed where Committee members raised questions about how to model breastfeeding during the second year of life as well as the rise in toddler formulas in the marketplace, analytic frameworks for FPM, use of simulated diets to explore how various combinations of food choices within a dietary pattern can achieve nutrient adequacy, capability of methods to identify and categorize ultra-processed foods, consideration of bioavailability when assessing nutrient adequacy of various patterns, and definitions of cultural diets.

DATA ANALYSIS

Dr. Dana DeSilva, Health Policy Fellow in HHS's Office of Disease Prevention and Health Promotion, reviewed federal data sources and metrics that will be used in the Committee's data analyses to inform the *Dietary Guidelines* and highlighted special considerations for the available data in light of the COVID-19 pandemic.

For the Committee's purposes, data analysis is a collection of analyses that use national data sets to describe the current health and dietary intakes of Americans. For the U.S. population at each life stage, these analyses describe and/or evaluate current patterns of food and beverage consumption, current intakes of food groups and nutrients, nutrients of public health concern, and prevalence of nutrition-related chronic health conditions. These data help make the *Dietary Guidelines* practical, relevant, and achievable.

The primary federal data source to be examined by the Committee is the National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey (NHANES)—specifically, it's What We Eat In America (WWEIA) data subset, which provides dietary intake data assessed from 24-hour dietary recall. WWEIA is supported by USDA's Food and Nutrient Database for Dietary Studies (FNDDS) and Food Pattern Equivalents Database (FPED). Other federal data sources include the National Health Interview Survey (NHIS) and the Surveillance, Epidemiology, and End Results (SEER) data set, which is the authoritative source for cancer statistics in the U.S. population. Dr. DeSilva elaborated on the design, data collection methods, and available data types from NHANES and WWEIA. She also described the Healthy Eating Index (HEI), a measure of diet quality to assess how well a set of foods and beverages aligns with the *Dietary Guidelines.* The HEI-2015 is the latest iteration and was designed to align with the *Dietary Guidelines for Americans, 2015-2020.* HEI-2020 will be published as an update that will align with the *Dietary Guidelines for Americans, 2020-2025.* This update will also include the HEI-Toddlers-2020 (for ages 12–23 months).

Data collection for NHANES 2019-2020 was suspended in March 2020 due to the COVID-19 pandemic, which resulted in missing data from March 2020-May 2021. Data from 2019 until March 2020 were combined with data from the prior NHANES cycle (2017-2018) to create nationally representative pre-pandemic data for the time period of 2017 up until March 2020. NHANES 2021-2022 dietary intake data will not be released in time for Committee analysis, therefore other data sources may be considered for insights about the pandemic's effect on dietary intake and eating habits (e.g., USDA Economic Research Service data on food spending, food prices, and food sufficiency). In addition, federal staff are conducting an evidence scan to identify appropriate non-federal sources of dietary intake data that may elucidate dietary intake during and shortly after the pandemic.

Following Dr. DeSilva's presentation, a Committee discussion followed and covered topics relating to all three sources of evidence that will complement each other as they inform the Committee's report.

COMMITTEE DISCUSSION

Dr. Sarah Booth (Chair) opened the floor to the Committee members and invited them to provide reflections on the day. Themes from their comments included gratitude for the expertise and support from federal staff, interest in further exploring the new and existing methods that the Committee will use to examine the evidence and ensuring that the resulting guidelines are applicable and useful for improving the health and wellbeing of all intended audiences.

CLOSING REMARKS AND ADJOURNMENT

Ms. Janet de Jesus thanked the Committee for their participation and invited the webcast audience to return for the second day of the meeting. She gave a brief preview of the second day's agenda and adjourned the first day of the meeting at 2:50 PM.

DAY 2 – February 10, 2023

CALL TO ORDER

Day 2 of the 2025 Dietary Guidelines Advisory Committee ("Committee") Meeting 1 was convened at 8:30 AM on Friday, February 10, 2023, at the Tower Oaks conference center of the Tower Building in Rockville, MD, the location of the HHS Office of Disease Prevention and Health Promotion.

Ms. Janet de Jesus, Designated Federal Officer for the *Dietary Guidelines* and a Nutrition Advisor in the HHS Office of Disease Prevention and Health Promotion, introduced herself, welcomed attendees to the meeting, and provided an overview of the day's agenda.

INTRODUCTIONS AND OPENING REMARKS

Ms. Carter Blakey and Ms. Jackie Haven provided introductions for Admiral Rachel Levine (HHS) and Deputy Under Secretary Stacy Dean (USDA), respectively, who provided opening remarks on behalf of the Departments.

Admiral Rachel Levine highlighted the opportunity for the *Dietary Guidelines* to contribute to achieving the goals of the National Strategy on Hunger, Nutrition, and Health, which are to end hunger and increase healthy eating and physical activity by 2030 so fewer Americans experience diet-related diseases, while reducing health disparities. She emphasized that each Committee member was selected following a rigorous vetting process and that the Committee is one of the most diverse to date with respect to subject matter expertise as well as racial and ethnic backgrounds. She also highlighted the importance of applying a health equity lens to the steps in the development of the *Dietary Guidelines* and reiterated the Departments' commitment to transparency of the overall *Dietary Guidelines* development process.

Deputy Under Secretary Dean echoed Admiral Levine's remarks about the importance and impact of the Committee's work to inform the *Dietary Guidelines*. She added that the *Dietary Guidelines* are a critical support for advancing both food security and nutrition security (the latter defined by USDA as all Americans having consistent and equitable access to healthy, safe, affordable foods essential to health and well-being), which are twin goals of the country's 15 federal nutrition programs that together serve one in four Americans.

PROPOSED SCIENTIFIC QUESTIONS TO BE EXAMINED BY THE COMMITTEE

Ms. Janet de Jesus explained the Departments' process to identify and develop the present list of proposed scientific questions, reviewed the list of questions, and discussed future refinement and prioritization of the questions.

HHS and USDA conducted a year-long process to gather information, consider input from federal experts, and review relevant documents to compile a draft list of scientific questions. Key information sources included the 2020 Committee's systematic review questions and recommendations for future Committees, NESR continuous evidence monitoring and evidence scans, the federal Interagency Committee on Human Nutrition Research, and federal staff with relevant expertise. The questions were posted for public comment in the Spring of 2022; more than 1,400 comments were received. Topics most often raised in the public comments included health equity; policy, systems, and environmental change strategies to improve healthy eating; ultra-processed foods; alcoholic beverages; sustainability, and low-carbohydrate diets.

The Departments used criteria to guide the development and refinement of the proposed scientific questions. This criteria included relevance (i.e., the questions are within the scope of the Dietary Guidelines and focus on food-based recommendations, not clinical guidelines or medical treatment), importance (the questions address an area of substantial public health concern or uncertainty in the U.S. context), potential impact to federal programs, avoiding duplication (with other federal efforts), and availability of research.

Ultimately, the questions that the Departments have identified for the Committee to investigate concern dietary patterns across life stages and their relationship to various health outcomes, including dietary patterns during pregnancy and lactation and related maternal and child health outcomes; specific dietary pattern components (e.g., complementary foods, beverages, added sugars, and saturated fat) and their relationship to selected health outcomes; strategies for individuals and families related to diet quality and weight management; and potential changes to USDA Dietary Patterns. Topics that do not require formal review by the Committee because evidence-based federal guidance already exists include, but are not limited to, healthy food environments, oral health, food safety, specific nutrient recommendations (see Dietary Reference Intakes), human milk and infant formula as they relate to health outcomes, seafood, eating disorders, and physical activity.

The Committee will refine and prioritize the scientific questions throughout its work using the same criteria identified by the Departments and may add a limited number of new questions.

DIETARYGUIDELINES.GOV AND OPPORTUNITIES FOR PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT

Lieutenant Commander Dennis Anderson-Villaluz described the *Dietary Guidelines* website and outlined opportunities for public engagement in the process of developing the *Dietary Guidelines*.

DietaryGuidelines.gov was launched in February 2019 with the objectives of 1) supporting implementation of the guidelines by providing the public with tools to administer nutrition programs, policies, and education, and 2) serving as a central hub to provide transparency about the development of the Committee's report and the final *Dietary Guidelines*. Website users can follow the Committee's work, explore the protocols for its evidence review methods, read about the history and previous editions of the *Dietary Guidelines*, access consumer-friendly educational materials, and learn how to get involved in the process by submitting public comments, attending virtual Committee meetings, and subscribing to email updates.

Key opportunities for public participation included submitting nominations for Committee members and providing public comments on the proposed scientific questions. Future opportunities include watching the webcast of the six public Committee meetings in 2023–2024, providing oral comments at the third meeting (September 2023), and submitting written public comments any time during the course of the Committee's operations. The comments will be available to the Committee as well, as they are publicly available at www.regulations.gov/docket/HHS-OASH-2022-0021.

CLOSING REMARKS, NEXT STEPS, AND ADJOURNMENT

Ms. Janet de Jesus thanked the Committee and federal staff involved in the meeting and its planning and adjourned the meeting at 9:23am.