### 2020 Dietary Guidelines Advisory Committee: DRAFT - Part D. Chapter 12: Added Sugars

Members Involved in Drafting this Chapter:

**Elizabeth Mayer-Davis** 



Heather Leidy Richard Mattes Timothy Naimi Rachel Novotny Barbara Schneeman

This chapter includes questions examined by the Beverages and Added Sugars Subcommittee and the Data Analysis and Food Pattern Modeling Working Group

DietaryGuidelines.gov

### **LIST OF QUESTIONS & METHODOLOGY**

- 1. What is the relationship between added sugars consumption and achieving nutrient and food group recommendations?
  - Answered using data analyses
- 2. What is the relationship between added sugars consumption and risk of cardiovascular disease?
  - Answered using a NESR systematic review
- 3. How much added sugars can be accommodated in a healthy diet while still meeting food group and nutrient needs?
  - Answered using food pattern modeling

Final protocols and draft conclusion statements available at DietaryGuidelines.gov Part D. Chapter 12: Added Sugars 2020 Dietary Guidelines Advisory Committee: *Meeting on Draft Report* 

#### QUESTION 1: ADDED SUGARS AND ACHIEVING FOOD AND NUTRIENT RECOMMENDATIONS: DATA ANALYSIS

Federal data were reviewed for infancy through older adults

- Reflected the most current NHANES cycle available
- Earlier cycles were used to compare changes in added sugars consumption over time

Main findings:

- In the U.S. population ages 1 and older, mean usual consumption of added sugars was 13% of daily energy intake in 2013-2016
- The estimated proportion of the population that met the guidance to consume less than 10% of energy from added sugars has *increased* from 30% in 2007-2010 to 37% in 2013-2016
- Nearly 70 percent of added sugars intake comes from 5 food categories:
  - sweetened beverages
  - desserts and sweet snacks
    - coffee and tea (with their additions)

- candy and sugars
- breakfast cereals and bars

Part D. Chapter 12: Added Sugars

2020 Dietary Guidelines Advisory Committee: Meeting on Draft Report

# QUESTION 2: ADDED SUGARS AND CVD: REVIEW OF THE SCIENCE

# What is the relationship between added sugars consumption and risk of cardiovascular disease?

- Answered using a NESR systematic review of literature published September 2012—September 2019
- 2015 Committee examined literature January 2000—August 2012
- 23 articles (3 in children; 20 in adults), representing 20 studies were included
  - Most of the studies examined were prospective cohort studies, although this review also included some randomized controlled trials
- Limited evidence of a relationship between greater consumption of added sugars and increased risk of cardiovascular disease mortality (8 studies)
  - Most of these studies were based primarily on SSB
- Insufficient evidence in children to answer this question (3 studies)
- Insufficient evidence in adults for: CVD risk profile (6 studies), ischemic cardiovascular events (3 studies), peripheral artery disease (2 studies), stroke (1 study), or heart failure (1 study)
  Part D. Chapter 12: Added Sugars

2020 Dietary Guidelines Advisory Committee: Meeting on Draft Report

### QUESTION 3: ACCOMODATING ADDED SUGARS: FOOD PATTERN MODELING EXERCISE 1

Estimating the number of calories in the base USDA Food Patterns that can be used for added sugars

#### Methods

- Identify the amount of essential calories in the base USDA Food Patterns
- Assign the remaining calories exclusively to solid fats and added sugars

#### **Definitions and Assumptions:**

- The base USDA Food Patterns are constructed using nutrient-dense representative foods that contain low or no saturated fat, added sugars, and sodium.
- "Essential calories" is the energy associated with the foods and beverages ingested to meet nutritional goals through choices that align with the USDA Food Patterns in forms with the least amounts of saturated fat, added sugars, and sodium.

Part D. Chapter 12: Added Sugars 2020 Dietary Guidelines Advisory Committee: *Meeting on Draft Report* 

### QUESTION 3: ACCOMODATING ADDED SUGARS: FOOD PATTERN MODELING EXERCISE 1 (1 of 3)

Essential Calories and Limit on Solid Fats and Added Sugars Across Calorie Levels in the Base USDA Food

Patterns for Ages 2 Years and Older

Calories	Essential	Percent	Calorie Limit for	Calories	Calories	Grams of Solid	Grams of	Percent
	Calories <sup>1</sup>	Essential	Solid Fats and	Assigned	Assigned to	Fats <sup>4</sup>	Added Sugars <sup>4</sup>	Calories
		Calories <sup>1</sup>	Added Sugars <sup>2</sup>	to Solid	Added Sugars <sup>3</sup>			Added
				Fats <sup>3</sup>				Sugars
Level	kcal	% kcal	kcal	kcal	kcal	g	g	%
1,000	872	87	128	70	57	8	14	6
1,200	1127	94	73	40	33	5	8	3
1,400	1318	94	82	45	37	5	9	3
1,600	1505	94	95	52	43	6	11	3
1,800	1665	93	135	74	61	9	15	3
2,000	1770	88	230	127	104	15	26	5
2,200	1960	89	240	132	108	16	27	5
2,400	2094	87	306	168	138	20	34	6
2,600	2265	87	335	184	151	22	38	6
2,800	2446	87	354	195	159	23	40	6
3,000	2574	85	426	235	192	28	48	6
3,200	2635	82	565	311	254	37	64	8

<sup>1</sup>Calories in pattern if all foods are consumed in nutrient-dense forms, without additional solid fats or added sugars

<sup>2</sup> Calculated from pattern calorie level minus essential calories

<sup>3</sup> Calculated as 55 percent of calories from solid fats and 45 percent from added sugars, based on mean population intakes 2013-2016

<sup>4</sup>Calculated using caloric values of 8.4 kcal per 1 gram of solid fats and 4 kcal per 1 gram of added sugars Part D. Chapter 12: Added Sugars

*Estimating the number of calories in the base USDA Food Patterns that can be used for added sugars* 2020 Dietary Guidelines Advisory Committee: *Meeting on Draft Report* 

### QUESTION 3: ACCOMODATING ADDED SUGARS: FOOD PATTERN MODELING EXERCISE 1 (2 of 3)

Essential Calories and Limit on Solid Fats and Added Sugars Across Calorie Levels in the Base USDA Food

Calories	Essential	Percent	Calorie Limit for	Calories	Calories	Grams of Solid	Grams of	Percent
	Calories <sup>1</sup>	Essential	Solid Fats and	Assigned	Assigned to	Fats <sup>4</sup>	Added Sugars <sup>4</sup>	Calories
		Calories <sup>1</sup>	Added Sugars <sup>2</sup>	to Solid	Added Sugars <sup>3</sup>			Added
				Fats <sup>3</sup>				Sugars
Level	kcal	% kcal	kcal	kcal	kcal	g	g	%
1,000	872	87	128	70	57	8	14	6
1,200	1127	94	73	40	33	5	8	3
1,400	1318	94	82	45	37	5	9	3
1,600	1505	94	95	52	43	6	11	3
1,800	1665	93	135	74	61	9	15	3
2,000	1770	88	230	127	104	15	26	5
2,200	1960	89	240	132	108	16	27	5
2,400	2094	87	306	168	138	20	34	6
2,600	2265	87	335	184	151	22	38	6
2,800	2446	87	354	195	159	23	40	6
3,000	2574	85	426	235	192	28	48	6
3,200	2635	82	565	311	254	37	64	8

<sup>1</sup>Calories in pattern if all foods are consumed in nutrient-dense forms, without additional solid fats or added sugars

<sup>2</sup> Calculated from pattern calorie level minus essential calories

<sup>3</sup> Calculated as 55 percent of calories from solid fats and 45 percent from added sugars, based on mean population intakes 2013-2016

<sup>4</sup> Calculated using caloric values of 8.4 kcal per 1 gram of solid fats and 4 kcal per 1 gram of added sugars

Part D. Chapter 12: Added Sugars

*Estimating the number of calories in the base USDA Food Patterns that can be used for added sugars* 2020 Dietary Guidelines Advisory Committee: *Meeting on Draft Report* 

### QUESTION 3: ACCOMODATING ADDED SUGARS: FOOD PATTERN MODELING EXERCISE 1 (3 of 3)

Essential Calories and Limit on Solid Fats and Added Sugars Across Calorie Levels in the Base USDA Food

Patterns for Ages 2 Years and Older

Calories	Essential	Percent	Calorie Limit for	Calories	Calories	Grams of Solid	Grams of	Percent
	Calories <sup>1</sup>	Essential	Solid Fats and	Assigned	Assigned to	Fats <sup>4</sup>	Added Sugars <sup>4</sup>	Calories
		Calories <sup>1</sup>	Added Sugars <sup>2</sup>	to Solid	Added Sugars <sup>3</sup>			Added
				Fats <sup>3</sup>				Sugars
Level	kcal	% kcal	kcal	kcal	kcal	g	g	%
1,000	872	87	128	70	57	8	14	6
1,200	1127	94	73	40	33	5	8	3
1,400	1318	94	82	45	37	5	9	3
1,600	1505	94	95	52	43	6	11	3
1,800	1665	93	135	74	61	9	15	3
2,000	1770	88	230	127	104	15	26	5
2,200	1960	89	240	132	108	16	27	5
2,400	2094	87	306	168	138	20	34	6
2,600	2265	87	335	184	151	22	38	6
2,800	2446	87	354	195	159	23	40	6
3,000	2574	85	426	235	192	28	48	6
3,200	2635	82	565	311	254	37	64	8

<sup>1</sup>Calories in pattern if all foods are consumed in nutrient-dense forms, without additional solid fats or added sugars

<sup>2</sup> Calculated from pattern calorie level minus essential calories

<sup>3</sup> Calculated as 55 percent of calories from solid fats and 45 percent from added sugars, based on mean population intakes 2013-2016

<sup>4</sup> Calculated using caloric values of 8.4 kcal per 1 gram of solid fats and 4 kcal per 1 gram of added sugars Part D. (

Part D. Chapter 12: Added Sugars

*Estimating the number of calories in the base USDA Food Patterns that can be used for added sugars* 2020 Dietary Guidelines Advisory Committee: *Meeting on Draft Report* 

#### QUESTION 3: ACCOMODATING ADDED SUGARS: FOOD PATTERN MODELING EXERCISE 1- Conclusion Statement

- Energy required to meet food group and nutrient needs using nutrientdense foods:
  - <u>>85%</u> more of total energy across most energy levels
- Assuming the remaining energy is distributed exclusively to solid fats and added sugars according to population-level proportional intakes:
  - ≤6% additional calories available for the consumption of added sugars for most energy levels
  - ≤8% additional calories would be available for only the highest energy level analyzed (3,200 calories/day)
- These scenarios assume:
  - individuals consume only recommended amounts of nutrient-dense foods and beverages and no calories from alcohol

Part D. Chapter 12: Added Sugars Estimating the number of calories in the base USDA Food Patterns that can be used for added sugars 2020 Dietary Guidelines Advisory Committee: Meeting on Draft Report

### QUESTION 3: REDISTRIBUTING ADDED SUGARS: FOOD PATTERN MODELING EXERCISE 2

Redistributing calories from the top reported sources of added sugars to foods and beverages that achieve food group and nutrient goals

#### Methods (for each age-sex group)

- Calculate calories from the 5 top contributing food/beverage sources of added sugars
- Quantify current mean intakes across the 5 food groups and identify those under-consumed
- Reassign calories from food/beverage sources of added sugars to increase intake of under-consumed food groups

### QUESTION 3: REDISTRIBUTING ADDED SUGARS: FOOD PATTERN MODELING EXERCISE 2 (1 of 3)



\*The analyses assume energy is redistributed to nutrient-dense food choices low in added sugars, solid fat, and sodium

Part D. Chapter 12: Added Sugars

*Redistributing calories from the top reported sources of added sugars* 2020 Dietary Guidelines Advisory Committee: *Meeting on Draft Report* 

#### QUESTION 3: REDISTRIBUTING ADDED SUGARS: FOOD PATTERN MODELING EXERCISE 2 (2 of 3)



\*The analyses assume energy is redistributed to nutrient-dense food choices low in added sugars, solid fat, and sodium

Part D. Chapter 12: Added Sugars

Theoretical Improvement in Nutrient

Redistributing calories from the top reported sources of added sugars 2020 Dietary Guidelines Advisory Committee: Meeting on Draft Report

#### QUESTION 3: REDISTRIBUTING ADDED SUGARS: FOOD PATTERN MODELING EXERCISE 2 (3 of 3)



\*The analyses assume energy is redistributed to nutrient-dense food choices low in added sugars, solid fat and sodium Part D. Chapter 12: Added Sugars

Redistributing calories from the top reported sources of added sugars 2020 Dietary Guidelines Advisory Committee: Meeting on Draft Report

### QUESTION 3: REDISTRIBUTING ADDED SUGARS: FOOD PATTERN MODELING EXERCISE 2 – Conclusion Statement

- 5 food categories contribute the majority of added sugars in the U.S. population and
  - Often energy-dense foods with low amounts of key dietary nutrients
- Redistributing energy from these 5 food categories to underconsumed food groups and nutrients
  - Could have a significant positive impact on overall diet quality and nutrient status
  - Age-sex groups could better meet food group recommendations for fruits, vegetables, and dairy
  - Could also increase consumption of key nutrients contained in these food groups

Part D. Chapter 12: Added Sugars Redistributing calories from the top reported sources of added sugars 2020 Dietary Guidelines Advisory Committee: Meeting on Draft Report

### QUESTION 3: TYPICAL CHOICES ANALYSIS: FOOD PATTERN MODELING EXERCISE 3

Estimating excess calories from added sugars when USDA Food Patterns are met with typical vs nutrient-dense choices

#### Methods

- Calculate the USDA Food Patterns with typical rather than nutrientdense choices
- Identify the contribution of added sugars to total energy in the USDA Food Patterns constructed with typical choices

Part D. Chapter 12: Added Sugars 2020 Dietary Guidelines Advisory Committee: *Meeting on Draft Report* 

#### QUESTION 3: TYPICAL CHOICES ANALYSIS: FOOD PATTERN MODELING EXERCISE 3



Part D. Chapter 12: Added Sugars

Estimating excess calories when USDA Food Patterns are constructed with typical choice vs nutrient dense 2020 Dietary Guidelines Advisory Committee: Meeting on Draft Report

### QUESTION 3: TYPICAL CHOICES ANALYSIS: FOOD PATTERN MODELING EXERCISE 3 – Conclusion Statement

- When the USDA Food Patterns are constructed with typical choices rather than nutrient-dense foods, the contribution of added sugars to total energy increases.
- If consumers eat the recommended quantities from each food group or subgroup, but do not choose nutrient-dense foods lower in added sugars, total energy will exceed daily needs.

# DISCUSSION

- A high proportion of total energy is accounted for by added sugars
- The totality of the evidence suggests limiting the consumption of added sugars to, at most, very low amounts
- Limitations within the available body of evidence should be considered:
  - Challenges in exposure assessment
    - Most studies focus on SSBs
  - Limited observational studies assessing intake over time
  - Limited RCTs
- Recent systematic reviews and meta-analyses provide additional supporting evidence of adverse effects of added sugars, particularly SSB, that may contribute to unhealthy weight-gain and obesity-related health outcomes

# SUMMARY: Draft Evidence-Based Advice to USDA and HHS

- The 2015-2020 Dietary Guidelines for Americans recommended consumption of added sugars be limited to 10% or less of total energy intake
- The prevalence of overweight and obesity is high and added sugars provide energy, generally without contributing additional nutrient content
- Based on updated analyses of dietary intake, model-based estimations of discretionary calories available for added sugars, and evidence for the potential health impacts, this Committee suggests:

Less than 6% of energy from added sugars is more consistent with a dietary pattern that is nutritionally adequate while avoiding excess energy intake than is a pattern with less than 10% of energy from added sugars

 Reducing the amount of added sugars in the diet, through changes in consumer behavior, how food is produced and sold, and food policies, is an achievable objective that could improve population health Part D. Chapter 12: Added Sugars

2020 Dietary Guidelines Advisory Committee: Meeting on Draft Report

#### DRAFT - Part D. Chapter 12: Added Sugars USDA/HHS Staff Who Supported this Chapter



#### **Support Staff:**

Meghan Adler Charlotte Bahnfleth Claire Brown Gisela Butera Natasha Cole Janet de Jesus Brittany Kingshipp Kristin Koegel Kevin Kuczynski

Emily Madan Julie Obaggy Richard Olson TusaRebecca Pannucci Julia Quam Anne Rodgers Jenna Seymour Maureen Spill Eve Essery Stoody

#### **DietaryGuidelines.gov**

#### **2020 Dietary Guidelines Advisory Committee: DRAFT - Part D. Chapter 12: Added Sugars**

Regan Bailey, PhD, MPH, RD

Purdue University

Heather Leidy, PhD

University of Texas



Barbara Schneeman, PhD University of California-Davis Chair



Kathryn Dewey, PhD

\*Massachusetts General Hospital



Harvard Medical School Vice Chair



Sharon Donovan, PhD, RD University of Illinois



Jamy Ard, MD Wake Forest School of Medicine



Steven Heymsfield, MD Louisiana State University



Linda Snetselaar, PhD, RD University of Iowa



Jamie Stang, PhD, MPH, RDN University of Minnesota



Lydia Bazzano, MD, PhD

Tulane University

Richard Mattes, PhD, MPH, RD

Purdue University



Carol Boushey, PhD, MPH, RD

University of Hawaii

Elsie Taveras, MD, MPH\* Harvard University





Boston University



Linda Van Horn, PhD, RDN, LD Northwestern University



2020 Dietary Guidelines Advisory Committee: Meeting on Draft Report



Rachel Novotny, PhD, RDN, LD

University of Hawaii



Joan Sabaté, DrPH, MD

Loma Linda University



